



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM

Case Number: A-02050032

Page 1 of 1

On [REDACTED] May 2002, we received an allegation that more than half of the work plan presented in the subject's declined NSF proposal¹ (the proposal) had already been completed because the results allegedly appeared in the subject's paper² (the paper) published prior to the proposal's submission.

We reviewed the proposal, the paper, and a letter from the subject to the NSF program officer about the concerns that some of the proposed work had been completed.³ The paper, which is cited three times in the proposal, stated that reported results were the first of their kind about one aspect of a particular model. Further, the proposal stated that the results in the paper were preliminary. Finally, the letter explained in detail the preliminary nature of the results presented in the paper and how these results represented the initial steps in the development of the proposed projects.

We concluded that, although the proposal could have described more carefully the relationship between the proposed projects and the preliminary results presented in the paper, the evidence clearly indicated that very little of the proposed work had been completed by the subject at the time he submitted his paper for publication.

This case is closed and no further action will be taken.

¹ NSF proposal [REDACTED], entitled [REDACTED] was submitted on [REDACTED] by the subject, [REDACTED]
² [REDACTED]
³ [REDACTED] contained concerns related to the amount of work already completed by the subject and presented in the paper.

	Agent	Attorney	Supervisor	AIGI
Sign / date	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED]