



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION  
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL  
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

## CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM

Case Number: ~~A0301006~~

A03010006

Page 1 of 1

The complainant<sup>1</sup> alleges that a Ph.D. thesis of the subject<sup>2</sup> contains essentially a verbatim transcription of the complainant's presentation given in 1992 at an International Conference, and is therefore plagiarism and fraud. The Ph.D. thesis of the subject was obtained, and the 1992 conference proceedings were obtained.

The 1992 conference presentation of the complainant describes a stress equation that is the focus of the alleged plagiarism. An equation of similar general form and of the same description appears in the subject's thesis. The text surrounding the equation in the subject's thesis is not similar to the text in the 1992 conference presentation of the complainant. The 1992 conference presentation ends with the statement that a more detailed account of this work will be forthcoming. The development of the mathematical expressions alleged to be plagiarized in the subject's thesis included several references to published papers of the complainant, and additionally, this section of the subject's thesis also contained references to published journal papers that identify themselves as more detailed follow-ups to the original 1992 conference presentation by the complainant. These two papers include an author<sup>3</sup> that also appears as one of the authors of the 1992 conference presentation. Both of these papers include reference to the 1992 conference presentation, and as journal publications are more widely available to readers than the 1992 conference presentation proceedings, these publications would reasonably be more appropriate references for the subject's thesis. The anteriority of the 1992 conference presentation is well documented in these publications.

There is no substance to the allegation of plagiarism or fraud.

Accordingly, this case is closed.

---

<sup>1</sup> Redacted

<sup>2</sup> Redacted

<sup>3</sup> Redacted