



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION  
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL  
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

## CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM

Case Number: A03060038

Page 1 of 1

On 26 June 2003, we received an allegation that the subject<sup>1</sup> inappropriately used ideas and data from an earlier Collaborative NSF proposal (the earlier proposal)<sup>2</sup> in his recent Collaborative NSF proposal (the recent proposal).<sup>3</sup> Further, the subject allegedly used these same data from the earlier proposal in presentations at meetings without the other earlier proposal's PIs' permission.

We determined that the earlier proposal was submitted jointly by three PIs including the subject. Following the earlier proposal's declination, the subject jointly submitted the recent proposal with one of the original PIs (PI #1).<sup>4</sup> We noted that the recent proposal was modified, excluding ideas specifically associated with another of the original PIs (PI #2)<sup>5</sup> in the earlier proposal. PI #2 was not included in the recent proposal. Further, PI #2 stated that it was PI #1 who developed the central ideas and data used in the earlier proposal. We also learned that PI #2 was not aware that PI #1 was included in the recent proposal. Finally, the earlier proposal had been submitted jointly as a collaborative effort in which the subject and PIs #1 and #2 shared their ideas and data. Consequently, the subject and PI #1 could use this shared information from the earlier proposal in the recent proposal without PI #2's permission. There is no substance to the allegation that the subject submitted the recent proposal, using ideas and data taken inappropriately from the earlier proposal.

Similarly, the alleged use of these same data from the jointly submitted earlier proposal without permission from the original PIs is without substance because the data in the earlier proposal were shared property as a result of this submission.

This case is closed and no further action will be taken.

<sup>1</sup> The subject, [REDACTED]

<sup>2</sup> [REDACTED]

<sup>3</sup> [REDACTED]

<sup>4</sup> [REDACTED]

<sup>5</sup> [REDACTED]