



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION  
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL  
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

## CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM

Case Number: A-03110070

Page 1 of 1

We received an allegation that subjects 1 and 2, PI and co-PI, respectively, on the NSF proposal (the subjects' proposal),<sup>1</sup> took the idea for the proposal from another scientist's NSF proposal (the scientist's proposal)<sup>2</sup> submitted over 1½ years earlier.

Our review showed that neither subject reviewed the scientist's proposal. We noted that subject 1 had been working in the particular area of research for at least 4 years and that the scientist's proposal cited subject 1's prior and continuing work in this particular area numerous times in the proposal, including lengthy discussions of subject 1's ongoing and prior work. The scientist explained that he frequently discussed with subject 1 what he was doing. Our comparison of the scientist's and the subjects' proposals showed that, although they contained similar ideas, the ideas were not identical.

This case is closed and no further action taken.

<sup>1</sup> NSF proposal [REDACTED], entitled "[REDACTED]" was submitted by subject 1, PI, [REDACTED], and subject 2, co-PI Dr [REDACTED]

<sup>2</sup> NSF proposal [REDACTED], entitled "[REDACTED]" was submitted by [REDACTED] submitted on [REDACTED]. This proposal was [REDACTED]