



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM

Case Number: A04040023

Page 1 of 1

An allegation was received that the author of a published research paper acknowledging NSF support stole concepts from a manuscript under review by that author (the subject).¹ The University² of the subject independently received the complainant's allegations, and completed an inquiry. The University found no research misconduct by the subject. We concur.

The subject provided extensive laboratory documents to the University to show that the questioned research publication was a culmination of work underway before the complainant's manuscript was received for review. The University accepted the provenance of the work. Additionally, experts consulted by the University concluded that the subject's publication, while related, did not mirror concepts taken from the complainant's submitted manuscript.

The complainant cites a delay in the publication of his paper as evidence for the theft of his concepts. However, the length of the publication process for the complainant's manuscript is unremarkable. The complainant points to a missing citation in the subject's paper to the complainant's previously published 2003 work as evidence of intellectual property theft. However, neither experts consulted by the University, nor the reviewers or editors of the subject's publication support a claim of any missing citation. The complainant's article of 2003 precedes the subject's publication of 2004; the scientific community will in time evaluate the relative contributions of these articles.

We conclude that there is no substance to the allegation.

Accordingly, this case is closed.

¹ Redacted.

² Redacted.