



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION  
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL  
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

**CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM**

Case Number: A11040028

Page 1 of 1

We reviewed an allegation that an NSF-funded professor<sup>1</sup> and his then graduate student<sup>2</sup> (now also a professor at another institution) failed to provide appropriate attribution to other researchers in work published<sup>3</sup> over more than 20 years ago. It is also alleged that they continue in their failure to provide attribution to the sources. The alleged sources<sup>4</sup> predate the first alleged act by 20-40 years. Our review of the literature showed that the professor and student provided appropriate attribution to either the alleged sources directly or to comprehensive review articles encompassing the alleged sources as well as numerous other sources. These reviews articles and a U.S. patent<sup>5</sup> provide substantive evidence that the professor's and student's work is a novel extension of the work of numerous predecessors in the field. Therefore, there is insufficient evidence to support an allegation of failure to provide appropriate attribution (*i.e.*, plagiarism).

Accordingly, this case is closed.

<sup>1</sup>

<sup>2</sup>

<sup>3</sup> The initial papers on the work include

<sup>4</sup>

<sup>5</sup>