



NATIONAL SCIENCE FOUNDATION
OFFICE OF INSPECTOR GENERAL
OFFICE OF INVESTIGATIONS

CLOSEOUT MEMORANDUM

Case Number: A12070047

Page 1 of 1

The complainant alleged a unique phrase and idea were first presented in a proposal he submitted to NSF¹ and a manuscript he submitted for publication. Shortly after the NSF proposal was reviewed, but prior to the publication of his manuscript, the complainant noted his unique phrase appeared in very recent papers by a research group.² Thus, the complainant suspected the subjects may have obtained the idea and phrase from reviewing his proposal.

We reviewed the list of reviewers for the complainant's proposal and none of the reviewers were authors of the papers. None of the reviewers were at the same institution as the subjects. Finally, we checked two reviewers at institutions near the subjects' institution, but found no connections. We conclude the allegation is not substantiated. Accordingly, this case is closed with no further action taken.

¹ [redacted]

² [redacted]

[redacted]

The complainant also mentioned this group created a Wikipedia page ([redacted]). The page was created by [redacted].