CLOSEOUT FOR M-93100054

On October 19, 1993, [redacted] officer, [redacted] of the [redacted] brought an allegation of plagiarism to OIG. He had received a review of NSF proposal [redacted] from the complainant, [redacted]. The proposal entitled [redacted] was submitted by the subject, [redacted] The complainant alleges that "bits" of his paper were "cribbed" without citation.

The complainant was contacted by OIG to clarify the allegations. He claimed that the subject's NSF proposal contained 1) excerpts copied from his paper without attribution, 2) passages from another author's paper that were cited and copied verbatim but not marked with quotations, 3) literature citations copied from his paper that could not have been from any other source, and 4) information gained exclusively from his paper that the subject had stated incorrectly.

OIG compared the papers above with the subject's NSF proposal. We found that although there were two almost complete sentences, one from each paper, and several phrases that were identical, the extent of apparent copying was minimal. We also determined that because of the narrowness of the field of proposed research, the subject could be expected to use the same source citations as the complainant. Moreover, the subject added other citations of his own. Finally, because the subject cited the complainant's paper, any information described in the proposal that might be incorrect is an issue that should be evaluated and resolved during the review process, not by OIG.

The OIG determined that the allegations were without substance.

This case is closed.

[redacted]

93-54

Concurrence:

Donald E. Buzzelli 12/17/93

Donald E. Buzzelli
Deputy Assistant Inspector General for Oversight

noted

James J. Zwolenik

James J. Zwolenik
Assistant Inspector General for Oversight

for LNB

Nancy Birnbaum
Counsel to the Inspector General

cc: Signatories
Inspector General

93-54