

Closeout Memorandum for Case No. M98020019

On 10 February 1998 we received an anonymous allegation that an NSF Program Director (PD)¹ in the Directorate for Engineering, Engineering Research Centers (ERC) Program had "manipulat[ed] . . . peer review," to improperly favor an NSF ERC grantee,² by omitting negative comments from the site visit reviews.

We examined the ERC grant jackets, and compared the site visit reviewer comments to the PD's summary and recommendations. We determined that the PD's summary and recommendations fairly incorporated the comments of the site visit reviewers, and did not appear to minimize criticism by the site visit team. In addition, we observed that the same individuals often served on the annual site visit teams. It is unclear why they would repeatedly agree to serve on the team if they believed that their analysis would be ignored. Based on this examination, we do not believe that a basis exists for further inquiry into this matter.

For these reasons, this case is closed and no further action will be taken.

cc: Legal
Investigations
Assistant Inspector General for Oversight
Inspector General

1 [REDACTED]
2 [REDACTED]